

## CDTC 2016-2020 Highway Safety Improvement Program (HSIP) Project Solicitation Evaluation Summary and Planning Committee Action

### Introduction

CDTC solicited for Highway Safety Improvement Program (HSIP) Projects for its 2016-2021 Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) in September with a submission deadline of September 23, 2016. CDTC's Planning Committee reserved approximately \$4.2 million in HSIP funding to program safety projects between federal fiscal years 2016 and 2020. As part of the application process, sponsors were required to attend an HSIP Application Workshop which was held on September 7, 2016. Three applications were received by CDTC as shown in Table 1 (project details are available in the project factsheets).

**Table 1: HSIP Application Summary**

Sponsor	Project Name	Location		Proposed TIP Description	HSIP Funds Requested (matched \$M)*
		Municipality	County		
Schenectady (City)	Broadway Traffic Signal Improvements	Schenectady	Schenectady	Broadway at Millard Street and Guilderland Avenue: Traffic Signal Replacement	0.355
Schenectady (County)	Nott Street Highway Improvement Project	Niskayuna	Schenectady	Nott Street/Balltown Road intersection redesign with new turn lane. Includes mill and fill of Nott Street from Balltown Road to Clifton Park Road.	1.303
NYSDOT	NY 146/NY 146A Intersection Safety Improvements	Clifton Park	Saratoga	NY 146/NY 146A intersection two-lane roundabout including high visibility crosswalks, sidewalk connections	3.825
<b>Total HSIP Funds Requested</b>					<b>5.483</b>

\* Sponsor project costs were screened by CDTC based on past federal aid experience and accepted as proposed. Inflation was added to account for the year in which the project is proposed for construction.

### Project Eligibility

As part of the project evaluation process, CDTC staff reached out to NYSDOT Region 1 Traffic and Safety to screen the three applications for HSIP eligibility. After some back and forth on the project details including clarifications from the project sponsors, the following comments on project eligibility were provided:

Route 146/Route 146A Intersection Safety Improvements: This project is eligible if the roundabout is selected as the preferred alternative. If another alternative is selected the safety benefits and eligibility will need further review.

Nott Street Highway Improvement Project: This project is eligible as proposed.

Broadway Traffic Signal Improvements: NYSDOT is working with the project sponsor to determine eligibility. A more detailed crash data analysis using MV104 crash reports and a signal warrant analysis are required.

## Project Evaluation

Per the solicitation guidelines, the Total Score of each project was calculated using the sponsor provided safety benefit/cost ratio and the CDTC Merit Score. CDTC staff screened the calculation of the sponsor safety benefit/cost ratio to ensure it utilized the NYSDOT HSIP methodology. CDTC staff calculated the merit score using the methodology contained in the 2016-2021 Transportation Improvement Program. The safety B/C and the Merit Score are each worth 50% of the Total Score. The evaluation results are summarized in Table 2 and complete details are available in the project factsheets.

**Table 2: CDTC Project Evaluation Results**

Project Name	Sponsor	HSIP Funds Requested (matched \$M)	Safety B/C Ratio	Merit Category Score	CDTC Total Score
Broadway Traffic Signal Improvements	Schenectady (City)	0.355	1.8	17.3	<b>19.1</b>
Nott Street Highway Improvement Project	Schenectady (County)	1.303	1.8	19.5	<b>21.3</b>
NY 146/NY 146A Intersection Safety Improvements	NYSDOT	3.825	1.7	19.5	<b>21.2</b>
<b>Total:</b>		<b>5.483</b>			

## Advisory Committee and Working Group Comments

As part of the evaluation process, CDTC had three of its committees review the proposals and offer comments. The following summarizes the comments:

### Bicycle and Pedestrian Advisory Committee

- Broadway Traffic Signals: Consider evaluating the role that right turns on red might have on the crashes occurring at the intersections.
- Nott Street: Support was expressed for the pedestrian improvements being proposed including new street lighting.
- NY 146/NY 146A: Support was expressed for the potential traffic calming opportunity that a roundabout might offer the NY 146 Corridor. NYSDOT is encouraged to consider a one lane roundabout in the design process.

#### Environmental Justice and Title VI Working Group

- NYSDOT is encouraged to work closely with the Town of Clifton Park on the design of the project such that the safety of pedestrians and bicyclists crossing NY 146 at the dedicated path is maintained and the uncontrolled crossing on the southbound slip ramp is improved.

#### Regional Operations and Safety Advisory Committee

- A number of questions were raised regarding each project. The consensus of the group was for CDTC staff to have more conversation with NYSDOT Region 1 Traffic and Safety to ensure all three projects meet the eligibility requirements of the HSIP program.

#### **Planning Committee Action**

At its November 2, 2016 meeting, CDTC's Planning Committee approved funding all three projects as listed in Table 3 at \$5.483 M with the Broadway Traffic Signals contingent on a positive finding on the warrants for the existing signals and confirmation of the safety benefits of the improvements to the traffic signals (larger faces and back plates) by NYSDOT. The eligibility of the Broadway project is to be determined.

**Table 3: Adjusted Federal Aid Request Based on Funding Availability**

<b>Project Name</b>	<b>Sponsor</b>	<b>Original HSIP Request (matched \$M)</b>	<b>HSIP Request Reduced Proportionally to Reach \$4.2 M</b>	<b>Additional Cash Match Required by Sponsor (\$M)</b>
Broadway Traffic Signal Improvements	Schenectady (City)	0.355	0.272	0.083
Nott Street Highway Improvement Project	Schenectady (County)	1.303	0.998	0.305
NY 146/NY 146A Intersection Safety Improvements	NYSDOT	3.825	2.930	0.895
<b>Total:</b>		5.483	4.200	1.283
<b>Total without Broadway:</b>		<b>5.128</b>	<b>3.928</b>	<b>1.200</b>

Note: The sponsors of the following safety projects in the fifth year of the TIP: A524-Albany County High Risk Rural Road Safety Program, R295-21st Street Realignment & Hoosick Street/Burdett Avenue Intersection and SA258-North Line Road/Old Post Road/Malta Avenue Intersection did not submit applications to move them into the four year programming period of the 2016-2021 TIP. Sponsor support for these three projects will be re-evaluated as part of the 2018-2023 TIP update.